

Volume 37
issue 3 / 2018

Contracampo e-ISSN 2238-2577
Niterói (RJ), 37 (3)
dec/2018-mar/2019

Contracampo – Brazilian Journal of Communication is a quarterly publication of the Graduate Programme in Communication Studies (PPGCOM) at Fluminense Federal University (UFF). It aims to contribute to critical reflection within the field of Media Studies, being a space for dissemination of research and scientific thought.

TRIBUTE CONCERT AS COLLECTIVE CATHARSIS: The presence of the attacks^{1 2}

ANA PAULA DA ROSA

Journalist, PhD in Communication Science at Unisinos, Master in Communication and Languages at Universidade Tuiuti do Paraná. Docent and researcher in the Post-Graduation Program in Communication Science at Unisinos, research line Mediatization and Social Process, Porto Alegre, Rio Grande do Sul, Brazil.
E-mail: anarosa208@yahoo.com.br

¹ This text has already been presented, orally, in the COMUSICA event that took place at UNISINOS in 2017. It is the text produced after criticism and suggestions from colleagues and participants. Special thanks to Thiago Soares for his tips.

² This work is a production of the National Program of Academic Cooperation (Procad) Cartografias do Urbano in Musical and Audiovisual Culture: Sound, Image, Places, and Territorialities in a comparative perspective involving UFF, UNISINOS, and UFPE.

PPG|COM Programa de Pós Graduação
COMUNICAÇÃO
MESTRADO E DOUTORADO UFF

TO REFERENCE THIS ARTICLE, PLEASE USE THE FOLLOWING CITATION:

Rosa, A. P. (2018). Tribute concert as collective catharsis: the presence of the attacks. *Contracampo*, Niterói, 37(3).

Submitted on: 08/01/2018 / Accepted on: 12/20/2018

DOI – <http://dx.doi.org/10.22409/contracampo.v37i3.19474>



Abstract

In the ambiance of mediatization, we see the potentialization of the socio-technical protocols that consolidate exogenous images in our collective imaginary. These images, as seen in journalism or in the spaces of mediatized social actors, trigger memories. And this article aims, precisely, to investigate the relation between music, images, and memory. Our focus is on the tribute concerts held, in a cyclical way, concerning terrorist attacks. Our starting question is: to what extent do tribute concerts become a performance strategy to perpetuate the attacks? To answer this question, we perform a multiple case analysis: the Concert for New York (2001), the show U2 for Paris (2015), and Ariana Grande's show One Love Manchester (2017).

Keywords

Image; Mediatization; Tribute concert; Attacks; Experience.

Introduction

In the current scenario of mediatization, there is a potential of socio-technical protocols that consolidate exogenous images (Belting, 2006) in our collective imaginary. Such external images, like those seen in journalism or spaces of mediatized social actors, tend to summon the symbolic structures, activating memories. And it is the relationship between music, images, and memory that this article aims to investigate. The focus, however, is on tribute concerts held, cyclically, related to terrorist attacks. Since 2001, with the attack on the Twin Towers in the USA, a process has been set up to promote shows in honor of the victims and to raise funds for their families. Such events transcend the space of music, potentialized by it, to interweave in the social fabric from the attempts to re-signify events and their presentness.

In this sense, our starting question is: to what extent do the tribute concerts become a performative strategy to perpetuate the attacks? To answer this question, we set out for a multiple-case analysis: Concert for New York (2001), U2 for Paris (2015), and Ariana Grande's One Love show for Manchester (2017). Despite the temporal differences between the shows and the logic of organization and mediatization, it can get seen that the tributes to the victims have ample potential for the evocation of memory and the creation of symbolic images.

From this corpus, the article will discuss the process of media circulation of the shows, both by journalistic institutions and by social actors that rework the senses. Thus, our hypothesis is that the circulation deals with a relation of attribution of value, in which music reiterates and make present the images already inscribed about the attacks, attributing to the facts a post-life through the performances. It is worth noting that, due to issues related to data collection, the analysis of the London concert in 2017 will be intensified, considering the modes of transmission, anchored in television, but also on social media.

As a starting point, we understand the concept of mediatization in this work, starting from Ferreira (2007), as the articulation that takes place between social and media processes within the *dispositifs*. The latter, in turn, are points of intersection and, in the case of music and images derived from the shows, are fundamental, since these are produced, shared and replicated in spaces linked to media institutions, but also of mediatized social actors.

In this way, we understand the present moment as part of an evolutionary process of mediatization¹, where media logic is no longer restricted to the space of traditional media but integrates culture. The domain of media logic confirms the positioning of Belting (2006) regarding the space of the technique that implies in another social *modus operandi*. This applies, for example, to image appropriations, like journalistic and artistic ones, which seem to have expanded according to the different levels of knowledge and the possibilities of access to technologies. The same is perceptible as to the appropriations of the songs, a case of Oasis 1995 song 'Don't look back in anger', which became a trademark of tributes in London (2017), chanted by hundreds of people. The same happened in 2015 with the song Imagine performed by Coldplay in tribute to the attacks in Paris.

According to John Blacking (2007, p. 200), music is part of the human infrastructure and can initiate social actions. "Music is not only reflective but also generative, both as a cultural system and as human capacity." In other words, it is a question of understanding music as a form of attribution of meanings and activation of memory. For the author (2007, p. 201), the songs are social facts and the analysis of the compositions and musical performances must "take into account both the work of critics and readers of texts as of the performers and re-creators of the music, this is, the interaction circuit". That is, it is not a matter of discussing what art is or is not, but how the tribute show acquires multiple dimensions from the attitudes and feelings brought to the surface by the processes of interaction.

¹ José Luiz Braga considers the process towards mediatization, since, although consolidated, it is not yet finalized, nor it is possible to know which extensions and derivations are yet to come.

The tribute show, born with the characteristic of memory, the tribute to great names of music, gets inserted as an element of collective catharsis and reification of the images of the attacks. For Jardim (2005, p. 30), "memory has an essential relationship with music, both in terms of the mythical music and memory of the Western culture, and in the actual realization of music itself." This is because memory is responsible for the constitution of the meaning of music that gets linked to orality. For Jardim (2005, P.31), this implies "maintaining the validity of memory beyond its function as a mere instrument or support. Memory has in music its highest degree of achievement." This realization allows music to unleash reality, even when it is accessible only by remembrance. The tribute shows remember, resignify and indicate a becoming.

Ariana Grande's show, for example, interrupted by the terrorist attack, when transformed into a tribute does not erase the previous images, but values them in the interaction, attributing not only to the victims but to the attack itself a logic of duration. In this regard, we summon the author Aby Warburg (2015) with the concept of *nachleben*, that is, afterlife. This reference image that music crystallizes through the stimulation of the physical senses is a living dead, which can be perceived explicitly or in a subtle reference. As for the music, it is necessary to verify if the concerts do not imply a strategy that also crystallizes the artist through the creation of deep ties between him/her and his/her public. In the light of the above, the study will be based on the empirical analysis to verify which circulation operations occur in the cut-out cases (circulation, circularity, media *phagia*), and the tension of authors linked to mediatization, music, and memory.

The construction of the cases: three concerts, similar operations

Terrorist attacks are not a recent phenomenon; perhaps they are as old as humanity itself. Historically, it gets indicated that the first act of terror would have been carried out in the Middle East in a territorial invasion of the Roman Empire. Such an act would have occurred between the first and second centuries BC². Subsequently attacks hit several countries including Russia, France, Italy, Algeria, Germany. However, since 2001, with the attack on the World Trade Center, a new way of experiencing terrorist actions was inaugurated: the real-time transmission. Such a milestone made it possible for us to be there in front of the scene, without really having been there, to cry the pain for the dead, to feel the fear, to record, in the memory, images that do not go out and which neither new attacks replace. From 2001 to 2017, numerous attacks were registered and covered by the international media; however, in the last two years, we saw an intensification of actions in Europe, mainly in countries that have commercial and political relations with the United States like France and England.

The case of this work gets configured from the production/circulation of three tribute concerts held in honor of the victims and the *heroes* of the attacks. Taking as a starting point the date of September 11th, 2001, we briefly recover the context of the event. The attack on the Twin Towers occurred on a Tuesday morning. Two commercial airplanes were hijacked in Boston and purposefully hit the two towers. In all, more than 3,000 people died, and hundreds more were injured and in shock. The Al-Qaeda group claimed responsibility for the attacks in the name of the Holy War, asserting that the attack on the towers, a symbol of American power, was a way of containing the country and its allies. Even 16 years after the action, the image of the blazing towers, and the flagrant of the plane crashing into the building remain impregnated in the retinas; to the point that with each new attack, the image of September 11th is recovered or overlapped, in a link which does not necessarily have to be visible, since it is of the order of meaning.

The tribute concert The Concert for New York City got held on October 20th, 2001. Organized

² Retrieved Dec. 21st, 2018, from: <<http://veja.abril.com.br/mundo/atentados-de-11-de-setembro-completam-15-anos/>>.

by Paul McCartney, it featured at least 20 musical attractions including pop artists of the moment, such as Backstreet Boys and Destiny's Child, and classic rock, like Mick Jagger and Keith Richards, Bon Jovi, Eric Clapton, Elton John, and David Bowie. The event brought together thousands of people at Madison Square Garden, with a special place for police officers, firefighters, doctors, and rescuers who have become the heroes of America. In about six hours of the show, artists took turns on stage. The opening got performed by David Bowie with two songs that gave the tone of the event: 'America', and 'Heroes'. With live broadcast on TV, the show raised funds for the families of the victims and ended with Paul McCartney singing 'Freedom'. The whole choice of repertoire assuredly got carried out so that the tribute show prioritized the valorization of the memory of the victims, but especially the image of a country of heroes, of ordinary people, who resist. Without getting into political and economic issues, the citizens of New York were the major honored. It gets noted that several photographs and videos of rescues, scenes of the attack, firefighters covered with soot and historical moments of the USA got used as the opening of the show. Such photographs and videos replicate the original event, amplifying the emotions and evoking memories.

The tribute The Concert For New York ended with the song 'Freedom', written by McCartney especially from the attack as a sort of manifesto. At the end of the show, the singer asked the audience to clap and sang: "I'm talking about freedom, I'll fight for your right to live freely," being cheered by the audience, already in tears. The repercussion of the show occurred both in traditional media and in web spaces, especially with postings of videos made from the capture of the TV broadcast itself. It was turned into a documentary by Woody Allen and Louis Horvitz in 2001. It is important to note that, before the show organized by McCartney, another tribute was organized by the actor George Clooney and broadcast by 35 American TV stations, entitled *America: a tribute to heroes*. The highlight, besides the bands like U2, and singers like Bruce Springsteen and Celine Dion, were the actors that permeated the two hours of the televising event. It is worth noting that, for this work, the New York concert was chosen, which does not diminish the importance of future analysis of the relations of mediatization in this event.

Now, the second observable of our case concerns the tribute show of the band U2 for Paris. The concert occurred one month after the terrorist attack that resulted in 129 dead. On Friday, November 13th, 2015 attacks were recorded in three parts of the French capital, one at the Bataclan nightclub, where the band Eagles of Death Metal was performing, another at the *Stade de France*, where the football match between the squads from Germany and France, and finally in front of a crowded restaurant on a bustling boulevard in Paris. Explosions, shootings, and suicide bombings killed a large number of people, particularly at the Bataclan nightclub, where first aid calls got made via Facebook pages. The Islamic State claimed responsibility for the simultaneous attacks. The most emblematic images of this event were injured people hanging on the windows of the nightclub, corpses in the street covered with aluminum material, and the public invading the field of the *Stade de France*. These scenes got replicated on newspaper pages, they occupied the covers, the editorial spaces of TV networks around the world, and were published and republished on social media.

Considering that the attacks in November made the band U2 cancel the tour in France, a tribute concert was organized for the days 06 and 07 of December of 2015 and transmitted live, via web and TV, to numerous countries, including Brazil. On December 7th, the Eagles of Death Metal band, that returned to the stage after the attack, made special participation. In an interview, Bono Vox said that music is the form of resistance to terror. Thinking about it, he wrote a song called *Streets of Surrender* for the Italian singer Zucchero. And he opened the show saying: "We are all Parisians and we will fight for freedom." The show got marked by technique; besides the sound effects, many lights got used, but often only the cell phone lanterns appeared, turning songs like *One* into a prayer a capella. In this case, even if the images of the victims or the city of Paris were not being displayed, they were summoned by their rejection, that is, Paris is the city of love, not of terror.

Our last observable, closing the three multiple cases, refers to the tribute concert titled One Love for Manchester by Ariana Grande. This event was organized by the American pop singer after the bombing in Manchester on May 22nd, 2017, a Monday, during one of her shows. The blast that killed 22 people, including children, occurred just after the singer finished her last song and left the stage. Soon after the show, the singer expressed on Twitter saying she got "hurt at the bottom of her heart." The repercussion of the attack was intense, to the point that fans and celebrities united on social media through the hashtags '#PrayforManchester', 'Ariana', and 'Manchester'. On June 4th, 2017, therefore, a few days after the attack Ariana returns to Manchester for the tribute concert, and more than 50,000 people attended the show which featured guest appearances by Justin Bieber, Katy Perry, Coldplay, Miley Cyrus, and Liam Gallagher. It was about three hours of show transmitted by various TV stations and also on the Internet.

The whole show was permeated by images of the victims and by duets. Chris Martin (Coldplay) and Ariana Grande sang 'Don't look back in anger', Oasis, which became a kind of anthem in honor of the victims, chanted at the top of the lungs by the public. The group Oasis is from Manchester, and Liam Gallagher, himself, sang 'Live Forever' with Chris Martin. 'Don't look back in anger' was sung by Londoners also during a vigil the day after the bombing. The last song of the show was Ariana's interpretation of 'Somewhere over the rainbow'. The singer's most repeated phrase during the show was that, in order to combat terror, "the love and the union that you show here is the remedy that the world needs now", and the pink color took over the entire stage. In the case of the One Love concert, the love for Manchester, for the victims, adds to the love, represented, in Ariana Grande's figure that, in her performance, seemed sweeter and more infantile than usual, becoming even closer.

After the presentation of these three observables, which integrate the corpus of this article, we can, in fact, delimit our case study³. That is, although they are three events or multiple cases, by a methodological judgment we consider that the three episodes constitute a research case. We observed that, in the three attacks, we have some central aspects: a) all derive in tribute concerts organized by renowned artists; b) the three shows meet the logic of intra and intermedia circulation, therefore, they get produced for mediatization; c) the images of the attacks and their victims get recovered in visual effects or via memory evocation; d) the memory is updated and, consequently, the experiences of the attacks get repeated collectively; e) the choice of the repertory, the effects, the performance tone move the ambiance of the space of the stage to the space of the audience, demanding interactions; f) both The Concert of New York and U2 for Paris have political appeal in the tone of their speeches, while One Love gets marked by the discourse of love and unity; g) only The Concert of New York and One Love bring images of the events, but even in face of their absence, the choice of the songs and the duets activate the endogenous images; h) in the three shows, the performance sets the tone of presentations, either because the artists represent the citizens, and, thus, become the other, or because they choose the staging and the drama as the essence. And, finally, (j) it is observed that in the three episodes, with more emphasis on Ariana Grande, the participation of social actors is determinant for the flow forward that is for the artists themselves to consolidate as a positive emblem of the attacks, attributing not a resignification, but a possibility of afterlife to the attacks themselves.

This broad relation of aspects evidences that the case is not in the execution of the shows themselves, but in what they generate: on the one hand, the presentness and eternalization of the event; on the other, the transformation of terrorist attacks into media events of solidarity and valorization of the artists themselves, which re-signify pain, even without erasing it.

³ We adopted in this article a methodology of construction of the case that has been organized and discussed in the scope of the PPG in Communication Sciences, Unisinos. It is a developing perspective by researchers such as Ferreira (2012), Rosa (2016), and students of the line of Mediatization and Social Processes, anchored in the idea that it is indispensable the constitution of a field of observation that allows the empirical approximation, before the theoretical framework.

Show in circulation: pain as a collective experience

Circulation is a central concept to think about today's communication. Although not a new theme, it is the aspect of mediatization that gains more attention as the process becomes socially complex. When we think of grammars of production and recognition, we are no longer able to distinguish their boundaries so clearly, because more and more grammars contact or intersect. This is not to say that the production of meaning is common and shared; on the contrary, there are numerous gaps, differences since the accesses get also differentiated. If we take the song of Oasis, chanted by the social actors on the streets of Manchester, and its maximum potential in Chris Martin and Ariana Grande's interpretation in the tribute concert, we can observe that there are appropriations, multiple consumptions, whether of the social actors, or of the institutions, as well as of the artists and their record companies, or of the media institutions themselves, like TV networks and YouTube channels. In our perspective, circulation is an invisible moment of articulation or clash between production and recognition, but it goes beyond an interval, being possible to follow the traces of materialities, and, thus, to understand the meaning in motion and dynamicity, even in the lyrics of the songs themselves.

Concerning tribute concerts, they get produced for circulation, that is, for their broad visibility. In this regard, photographic images, journalistic records, and amateur videos that were circulated to *give face* to the attacks are now incorporated, reworked, linked to the songs and, thus, govern new social meanings that gain concreteness in the structure of performances. They are no longer static images, of a tragic moment retained in time, they are updates revived in an experience that is collective: the show. In this way, we understand that there is an intense work of valorization between the communicative instances that interact from the access and the uses of the devices, like the social media, since, in the three observables, we verify that the presence of the social actor does not only occur physically in the place of the tribute show but in its extension via web.

For Fausto Neto (2013, p. 47), "the technique, instead of producing an increase in the distances between producers and receivers, tries to shorten them, gathering them now in the form of contacts." In addition, in all three cases, television has an important role since the shows get produced for broadcasting. This implies rules, formats, effects, frameworks, and, therefore, ways of seeing. In the case of the 2015 and 2017 concerts, the web plays a decisive role especially in the tribute concert to Manchester, when the live broadcast got performed online. This allows the concert shown on BBC to be carried out by a Brazilian fan or other celebrities in an intense process of social and media *phagia*⁴. In other words, our perception is that, despite the differences and lags, there is an overlap that manifests itself through the techno-discursive practices, accentuated, in this case, by the emotional appeal of the songs.

The tribute concerts that make up our field of observation can be understood as interacting *dispositifs* (Braga, 2006) since that from them derive circuits (Braga, 2012) that consolidate certain images-memory of the attacks. From this angle, we work with the hypothesis that circulation implies a relation of value attribution because only those images taken as relevant receive a condition of permanence. In the same way, if we think in musical terms, each of the tributes brought up a set of songs referring to the band's repertoire, but especially to the themes at stake, sometimes political, or affective appeal.

However, the songs that have adhered to the facts as their sound emblems are those of greater clamping capacity and circularity. Take, for example, the songs Freedom, by Paul McCartney, America or Heroes, by David Bowie, One, by U2, or Oasis's Don't Look Back in Anger. The more they circulate, tied to

⁴ The concept of social and media phagia was developed by Rosa (2016) and has been activated by empirical materials. Social phagia refers to the consumption, by social actors, of images and other productions made available by non-media or journalistic institutions that are reverberated in the devices of the actors, including appropriations and changes of meaning. Now the mediatic phagia refers to the consumption that the traditional media themselves make from the elaborations of the social actors, including them in their spaces and logic.

the attacks, the more they settle. The journalistic production, for example, which once got considered as possessing the capacity to unify discourses and, therefore, to generate a unique perspective, today still produces the seal of events, legitimizing them, but the occurrence of unification of meaning is not in doing one or the other, but in collective creation.

Assuredly, in all three concerts, the artists have been criticized, but both criticism and adhesion endorse the valorization of interactions, which refers to the concept of totem-images (Rosa, 2012). This concept, anchored in Cassirer's formulations and Durkheim's totemism, accounts for images that summon for a deep bond of the social, activating the collective imaginary; at the same time, it implies restrictions on the access of new images and interpretations since such audiovisual products constitute barriers. The totem-images are consolidated by the process of intra and inter-media circulation (Ferreira & Rosa, 2011), which is promoted by both social actors and journalistic institutions. Even though there are attempts of rupture, the entrance of new images and meanings, such actions tend to be socially rejected because the first image is transcendent.

In the three tribute concerts analyzed, totem-images are those which, on the one hand, consolidate themselves as being the images of the events, therefore, the episodes themselves; and, on the other hand, that mental images, provoked by the songs, convene this deep social bond preventing that critique to the singers or manifestations that indicate a logic of market or cultural industry gain space and reverberation. In summary, the tribute concerts signify the attacks and create a kind of barrier to alternative interpretations.

It is in this sense that we think of the notion of collective catharsis. Renata Rezende (2015), when dealing with cathartic narratives via Facebook, appeals to Aristotle to the conceptualization of catharsis. Thus, in our observables an emotional emanation gets identified and is propitiated by music, making this collective experience occur in the time of sharing, even if overlapping past and future times. Still according to Rezende, the concept of catharsis taken from the Aristotelian conception,

is based on the fact that some emotions can be released through an emotional discharge brought about by a dramatic situation. In Ancient Greece, catharsis was understood as the awakening of *eleos* and *phobos*, respectively piety and fear, from a representative action that would take place in the tragedy, as a process of identification, in an economy of affections that would result in a state of purification of the being [author's italics]. (Rezende, 2015, p. 229).

In addition to the Greek tragedy, we perceive in the events under analysis that social dramas are shared dramas since they reach an entire collectivity and, thus, cannot be measured *only* by the fatal victims that statistics point out. Assuredly, however, the forms of realization of this collective catharsis become the media circulation. It can manifest itself in the social networks' discourses or in the performances of the tribute concerts, which are not limited to a set of cultural attractions that take place for three or four hours on a stage, but in a performative way of doing it, according to Schechner (1985), in a sequence of steps that extrapolate the moment itself. These steps can get thought of like the previous ones (rehearsal, warm-up, choice of repertoires, bands), the performance itself, and, finally, the cooling (and soon its interiorization), and the consequences. As one of the main consequences, we point out both the intensification of the attacks in the circulation from its post-show resignification and the valorization of the artists responsible for the tributes, raising them to a level that approaches the *sacred*.

The tribute concert: when the stars cry

Thinking about musical performances as a space that goes beyond the borders of the stage is fundamental to understanding the procedural of performing shows in honor of the victims of the attacks. This is because it is not a matter of focusing on music as a product, but rather as the social and affective

linkages that empower it. There is a process of attribution of social meaning, therefore, of significance, not only of music but of the very events. This implies, therefore, that the tribute concert does not get restricted in itself and neither thought of by the sonorous bias, but for what this sonorous bias can evoke/update collectively. Victor Turner (2004) dedicated to studying the rituals and the performances practiced in them. One of the central elements, according to this author, is to understand ritualistic performance as a closure, a complete work. From this point of view, we can consider that the tribute concert, carried out a few months after the occurrence of the attacks, finalizes and consolidates the experience, reverting it into an image memory.

However, the performance only exists through the presence of the other, which is not the mere audience, but part of the interaction game. And this has repercussions on the behavior of the artists themselves, organizers or participants of the shows. Take The NY Concert in 2001 as an example, when David Bowie and even Paul McCartney presented the voice trembling and, to a certain extent, choked with emotion. The same thing happened, explicitly, with Ariana Grande, who for several moments interrupted the music to cry and, in tears, to be cheered by the public. Ariana's tears and McCartney's emotion bring them closer to those who are, now, honored, makes them more mortal, allowing an immediate identification that later becomes a strategy for recognition of artists, even when outside their home countries. In both U2 and Ariana's case the social network posts about the shows are of gratitude to the singers, and even a shifting focus, the attacks are overshadowed by the stars that cry. In the case of 2017, fans of the American pop singer came to post that "Good thing she's fine," "Stay strong, Ariana" ... phrases that refer much more to the valorization of the artist as an ordinary being, although sacred, than to the victims of the attacks themselves.

In addition, the attempt to generate an ambiance of closeness and belonging is manifested, in the tribute concerts, by a set of operations ranging from the choice of music, the costume, to the way of dancing. According to Jeder Janotti and Thiago Soares (2008, p. 104),

In addition to the performative aspects, related to rhythm and musical performance, the corporal and vocal configuration gets also linked to the communication strategies that involve the constitution of the image of the pop music performers, which allows the establishment of bonds between musician and listener, involving the tenuous relationship between interpreter, character, and public person. The different connections of sound intensity, reverberation, voice pitch in relation to the percussive and harmonic instruments get directly linked to the horizons of expectation of different musical genres.

Although the authors are concerned about performance in video clips, we take their conceptions to understand that in a tribute concert, body configuration is essential. Ariana wearing a white sweatshirt, allusive to the event, the American flag on stage in 2001, interacting with the bands, and the manifestation of love for Paris made by Bono Vox give indications that communicational and certainly marketing strategies also permeate these events. Richard Schechner (1988) himself indicates that every performance has a market value, but that socially attributed value is always more important. Even simple products marketed at events, such as sweatshirts and T-shirts, gain another value when integrating performance narratives.

Brief considerations of the aftermath of the attacks

From the exposed throughout this text, two issues get recovered as central: a) the inter-media circulation and b) the performance as presentness/update of the attacks. Although other topics also deserve attention, our intention is to emphasize that the tribute concerts, not only those that integrate the corpus of the article, as well as the many others already held, would not become so representative as to promote a social catharsis if it were not for the effects of mediatization. That is, the concerts are already born within a culture pervaded by the media culture, which does not imply media centrism, but the

understanding that the social fabric gets permeated by strategies and logic of visualization, grammars of production and recognition. Thus, the inter-media circulation, characterized by the production of meaning in multiple devices is a mark of these events. Since 2001 until the 2017 tribute concert, all the shows got created as main events, not only for the local public, but as events that aim to cross the territorial borders, whether through television, documentaries, but primarily through social media.

In this way, interactional flows get organized and begin to produce circuits around the attacks. These are not limited to records of events and testimonies of victims and families, but they get prolonged each and every time they get recalled in concerts and song lyrics composed especially for the tragedies in question. Just as we say that the poet needs the pain, composers find in the extreme situations of everyday the inspiration for social and political lyrics. And both the songs and the organization of the shows themselves become evocative elements of already seen images and, consequently, of memories.

We can say that the attacks are present in a kind of (re) occurrence of events, once the exogenous images (photographs, videos, records) that have already been widely seen get updated and become part of the tribute concert scene itself. It is not a mere collage of background, but an environment that settles in, where pain and emotion are dynamizing the images themselves. We consider that the events of homage to the victims or to the heroes reiterate the images already inscribed in the circulation and, therefore, in the collective imaginary, through the music and its possibility to maintain the validity of the memory since it stimulates the production of meanings.

These meanings, which can get recovered in the lyrics of the songs or the performance of the artists, show that the tribute concerts analyzed here are not intended to erase the past, to forget the events, to cover up the attacks. On the contrary, its foundation is exactly to valorize, to recover what happened in order to, in the interaction, assign a duration. We turn once again to Aby Warburg (2015), which deals with the concept of *nachleben*, that is, afterlife. For the author, an image does not die before its disappearance, but it makes itself present, like a shadow, beyond the years and the intervals. The references of works of art or photography get contained in other later works, even if by approximation traits. In this way, a current image carries shadows, traces of previous images that interfere with our way of making sense. When we transpose this notion to music, we mean that tribute concerts crystallize the reference of the attacks, causing them to remain in circulation, guiding new themes and interactions, creating an atmosphere of belonging to the point that the artists, themselves, lose their origins and identity traits to merge, performatively, with the audience who returns them with the attribution of a new status, both as musician and a real person, as one who shares the same experience. Therefore, the artists who organize the concerts also have the right to remain.

References

- Belting, H. (2006). *O fim da história da arte: Uma revisão dez anos depois*. São Paulo: Cosac Naify.
- Blacking, J. (2007). Música, cultura e experiência. *Cadernos de Campo*. Vol 16. Nº 16, p.201-208) São Paulo: USP. <http://revistas.usp.br/cadernosdecampo/article/view/50064>
- Braga, J. L. (2012). Circuitos versus Campus. In: J.J.; M.M.A.; J.N. (Eds.), *Mediação & Mídiação* (p.31-52). Salvador: EDUFBA, Brasília COMPOS.
- Braga, J. L. (2006). Sobre a mediação como processo interacional de referência. *Anais da 15ª Encontro Anual da Compós – Associação Nacional dos Programas de Pós-graduação em Comunicação*, p. 09-35). Bauru: UNESP. <http://www.midiaticom.org/jose-luiz-braga-mediatizacao-como-processo-interacional-de-referencia/>
- Ferreira, J. (2007). Mídiação: dispositivos, processos sociais e de comunicação. *Revista E-compós*. Vol. 10, p. 1-13). <http://www.compos.org.br/seer/index.php/e-compos/article/viewFile/196/197>

Ferreira, J.; Rosa, A. P. (2011). Miatização e poder: a construção de imagens na circulação intermidiática. IN TEMER, A. C. R. P. (Eds.) *Mídia, Cidadania & Poder* (p. 19-38). Goiânia: Facomb/FUNAPE.

Homan, S. (2006). *Access All Eras: Tribute Bands and Global Pop Culture: Tribute Bands and Global Pop Culture*. McGraw-Hill Education (UK).

Janotti Júnior, J.; Soares, T. (2008). O videoclipe como extensão da canção: apontamentos para análise. IN *Revista Galáxia*, n. 15, p. 91-108.

Janotti Júnior, J., Lima, T. R., Pires, V. (Eds.). (2011) *Dez anos a mil: Mídia e Música Popular Massiva em Tempos de Internet*. Porto Alegre: Simplíssimo. https://www.academia.edu/8020123/Dez_anos_a_mil_m%C3%ADdia_e_m%C3%BAsica_popular_massiva_em_tempos_de_internet

Jardim, A. (2005). *Música: Vigência do pensar poético*. Rio de Janeiro: 7Letras.

Oliveira, W. C. (2017). *Música: A forma ABA - linguagem e memória*. P.83-86. <http://periodicos.ufpb.br/index.php/actas/article/viewFile/16530/9456>

Rezende, R. (2015). Política e afeto no tempo das redes: ou a catarse coletiva - uma análise da Mídia Ninja. IN *Revista Ação Midiática*, nº. 10. Jul/Dez. Curitiba: PPGCOM-UFPR, p. 225-242. <http://revistas.ufpr.br/acaomidiatica/article/view/40847/26984>

Ritter, J., Daughtry, J. M. (2013). *Music in the Post-9/11 World*. Routledge. https://books.google.com.br/books?id=IWrhAQAAQBAJ&dq=musical+tribute+to+attacks+london&lr=&hl=pt-BR&source=gbs_navlinks_s

Rosa, A. P. (2012). *Imagens-Totens: A fixação de símbolos nos processos de mídiatização*. São Leopoldo: Unisinos, (Tese de doutorado). <http://biblioteca.asav.org.br/vinculos/000003/0000033A.pdf>

Rosa, A. P. (2016a). De reflexos a fagias: os níveis de circulação e apropriação midiática das imagens. IN Cingolani, G., Sznaider, B. *Nuevas mediatizaciones, nuevos publicos*. Argentina. Rosario: UNR Editora. Editorial de la Universidad Nacional de Rosario.

Rosa, A. P. (2016b). Imagens em proliferação: a circulação como espaço de valor. IN *Anais do V Colóquio de Semiótica das Mídias*. Japaratinga: UFAL, p. 01-14.

Schechner, R. (2004). *Performance theory*. New York: Routledge.

Turner, V. (1974b). *O processo ritual: Estrutura e antiestrutura*. Petrópolis: Vozes.

Veron, E. (2013). *La semiosis social 2: Ideas, momentos, interpretantes*. Buenos Aires: Paidós.

Warburg A. (2015). *Histórias de fantasmas para gente grande*. São Paulo: Companhia das Letras.