

## Foreword

# Textual Criticism: More than important, an essential practice for literature studies

Manoel Mourivaldo Santiago Almeida<sup>1</sup> 

Ceila Maria Ferreira Batista<sup>2</sup> 

<sup>1</sup> We use the word “universe” here in accordance with its use to express the scope of Textual Criticism in the short course “Universe of Textual Criticism” taught by João Dionísio at Universidade Federal Fluminense in 2008, during an event held at the Ecdotic Laboratory (Labec-UFF).

<sup>2</sup> The word “incarnations” is used by Roger Chartier to refer to the materializations of texts in editions. (see: *The author’s hand and the printer’s mind*, translated by Lydia G. Cochrane, Cambridge: Polity Press, 2014).

The universe of Textual Criticism is that of a dialogue between the production, transmission, and reception of literary and non-literary texts<sup>1</sup>. By production, we understand the process that encompasses the writing of a text or work, including the traces of previous research carried out for its writing, not apart from the context of its materialization. By transmission, we understand the various “incarnations”<sup>2</sup> of a work or its single materialization, which is also dependent on the context of publication. With regard to reception, Textual Criticism investigates readings, interpretations of texts or works in a given space and period of time.

That said, it is not for nothing that Professor João Dionísio, from the University of Lisbon, has named the scope of this discipline as “the universe”. Indeed, its object of study and investigation is broad, although its dissemination and recognition in the Brazilian academic world are still limited.

For those of us who work in the field of Textual Criticism and have organized the present volume of the *Gragoatá* journal, it is very difficult to understand why it has not been widely recognized yet as one of the fundamental disciplines in Literary Studies, for example. However, it is worth remembering that Brazil has not gone unscathed through the “day that lasted 21 years”, a day which completes its 60th anniversary in 2024 and reminds us that dictatorship and torture can never happen again. We believe that one of the fractures produced by the Brazilian dictatorship era was to nurture an aversion for studies related to historicity in general, and in the area of Literature and Linguistics, in particular.

**Silvio Renato Jorge**  
Editor-in-chief  
Literary Studies

<sup>1</sup> Universidade de São Paulo. São Paulo, SP, Brazil. E-mail: [msantiago@usp.br](mailto:msantiago@usp.br)

<sup>2</sup> Universidade Federal Fluminense. Niterói, RJ, Brazil. E-mail: [ceilaferreira@id.uff.br](mailto:ceilaferreira@id.uff.br)

### How to cite:

ALMEIDA, Manoel Mourivaldo Santiago; BATISTA, Ceila Maria Ferrira. Textual Criticism: More than important, an essential practice for literature studies. *Gragoatá*, Niterói, v. 29, n. 63, e63124, jan.-apr. 2024. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.22409/gragoata.v29i63.63124.en>

Textual Criticism is closely related to historicity as well as to changing, and one of its central notions is that even written texts undergo changes throughout their transmission processes. In other words, it is essential for scientifically based studies to be careful in choosing the editions of the works that are going to be worked on. Any oversight in this regard could compromise the result and seriousness of one's research.

The practice of Textual Criticism also helps us to promote a kind of "brushing history against the grain"<sup>3</sup>, as research on primary sources in archives or libraries favors, depending on who carries out the research, the practice of recovering texts and readings, something that is extremely important in a country like ours that has suffered a process of colonization, slavery, erasure of the history of the defeated, and, therefore, has a long way to go in terms of social inclusion, citizenship, as well as promotion, defense and strengthening of democracy.

In this volume of the *Gragoatá* journal, which is focused on such an important discipline, we hope to contribute to the dissemination and appreciation of Textual Criticism not only in universities in Brazil, but also in other countries, and even outside the academic walls. Below, we introduce the contributions gathered here, followed by a short presentation of their authors.

This volume begins with "The first Brazilian edition of Almeida Garret's *Frei Luís de Souza*. Aspects of textual variation", written by João Dionísio, who is a professor of Portuguese Literature and Textual Criticism at the University of Lisbon, and a member of the prestigious *Equipa Pessoa* (a working group for the study of the legacy and the critical edition of the complete works of Fernando Pessoa), coordinated by Ivo Castro. From a philological perspective, Dionísio deals with the first Brazilian edition of *Frei Luís de Sousa*, by Almeida Garret. In his paper, the author articulates issues related to the transmission of Garret's work, highlighting its importance for the comparative history of European Portuguese and American Portuguese variants, interpreting such variants according to Greg's famous pair of conceptual adjectives, accidental and substantive.

The second paper entitled "The Authorial Aesthetic Intentionality in *Uma Duas*, by Eliane Brum" was written by Neila da Silva de Souza, PhD in Literature, University of Brasília (UnB), member of the Metaphor Studies and Language Research Group and Literature of Amazonian Expression, Federal University of Amazonas (UFAM) and the Epistemology of Romance Research Group, University of Brasília (UnB). The author offers us an intriguing text addressing the novel *Uma Duas*, published for the first time in 2011, by the writer, journalist and documentary filmmaker Eliane Brum. In this article, which is a contribution to the dissemination of the literary work by the Director of *Sumaúma Jornalismo*, a discussion is proposed on authorial intentionality and the materiality of the text, themes dear to Textual Criticism even more so today.

<sup>3</sup> The expression "brushing history against the grain" comes from an excerpt by Walter Benjamin in "On the concept of history". "History of the defeated" is also used according to Benjamin.

The volume continues with “Some reflections on Textual Criticism in Italy: methodologies, foundations and challenges”, by Raphael Salomão Khede, who is a professor of Italian Language and Literature at the State University of Rio de Janeiro (UERJ), with robust training in Textual Criticism. As we know, Textual Criticism is widespread in Italy, and the article by Raphael Salomão Khede, who studied there, brings us a tradition of studies by Italian philologists that is not well known in Brazil, despite being of immense importance for Literary Studies. In other words, this article is a great contribution to increase the dialogue between Brazilian and Italian philologists, as well as to a broader appreciation of Philology as Textual Criticism.

The following paper entitled “*Ad usum Delphini* Collection: The Dawn of Censorship in the Printed Edition of Classical Texts”, was written by Fábio Frohwein de Salles Moniz, who is a Professor of Latin Language and Literature at the Department of Classical Literature at the Faculty of Arts at UFRJ (FL-UFRJ). The author is deputy leader of the Textual Critical Research Group, at the National Library Foundation (RJ). In his thought-provoking article, Moniz allows us to learn strategies, mainly those from the 17<sup>th</sup> century in France, for editing texts from classical Latin and Greek literature, as well as the outcomes of these strategies, such as purges of excerpts from works. The author provides us with information about some of those responsible for preparing the text of specific volumes of the *Ad usum Delphini* Collection and also reveals the name of a woman who was among those responsible for some volumes. Frohwein’s article shows us indisputable examples of censorship, which reminded us of problems in the so-called school editions of *Os Lusíadas*, by Luís Vaz de Camões, during the monarchy period and, later, during the *Estado Novo* dictatorship, which lasted 41 years, in Portugal. We most likely have such a memory, as, in 2024, we are celebrating the 500<sup>th</sup> anniversary of Camões and the 50 years of the Carnation Revolution, which fortunately overthrew the aforementioned dictatorship.

The sixth paper in this volume entitled “Exploring *Terra Crua*: For the Genesis of the Book by Jorge Ferreira Duque Estrada” was written by Helcius Pereira and Marcelo Módolo. Helcius Pereira is a professor at the State University of Maringá, and Marcelo Módolo is a professor of Philology and Portuguese Language at the Department of Classical and Vernacular Literature at the Faculty of Philosophy, Letters and Human Sciences at the University of São Paulo (FFLCH-USP). The authors discuss the genesis of an important work by Jorge Ferreira Duque Estrada on the founding of the city of Maringá, in the state of Paraná, as well as aspects of its reception.

Next, we have an article entitled “Brazilic Folklore in the Second Act of *Na festa de São Lourenço*, by Anchieta (1587): Critical-interpretative and Historiographical Issues”, by Leonardo Ferreira Kaltner, who is a Professor at the Universidade Federal Fluminense (UFF), and member of the Brazilian Academy of Philology (ABRAFIL), and Melyssa Cardozo

Silva dos Santos, a PhD student in the Postgraduate Program in Language Studies at UFF. Their article deals with a work by Anchieta that was written in three languages, including Tupi, and aspects of his exegesis, a topic also dear to Textual Criticism.

The seventh article, “Thomas Middleton’s Dramatic Social Spaces”, was written by Régis Augustus Closel, who is a professor at the Federal University of Santa Maria (UFSM), translator and editor of literary texts from the English language of the 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> centuries. The author offers us the opportunity to access issues relating to women and land from a social-economic perspective in some of Thomas Middleton’s works. In this sense, it is also in line with Textual Criticism, as it welcomes the willingness to deal with themes that promote what we refer to, quoting Walter Benjamin, as we have done previously, as a kind of “brushing history against the grain”.

Similarly, in the following article entitled “By herself - Analysis of the Short Story “The Bride” by Maeve Brennan”, Rosani Ketzer Umbach, who is a Full Professor at the Federal University of Santa Maria (UFSM), and Sabrina Siqueira, a doctoral researcher at the same institution, analyze a short story by the Irish writer Maeve Brennan, still little known in Brazil, but which addresses a theme that discusses class and gender prejudices and a certain type of xenophobia, in addition to emphasizing the struggle for self-determination of the Irish people and dealing with the diaspora, more specifically related to Irish women, in the United States. It is worth highlighting that Brennan’s protagonist is a character from an economically less favored class, which is also relevant in a country with as much social exclusion as ours. In addition, the authors’ contribution to this volume sheds some light on a piece of literature and an author that is little known in Brazil.

The ninth article, “Theory, authorship...”, was written by Fábio Almeida Carvalho, a Full Professor at the Federal University of Roraima (UFRR). This article addresses issues that are very important to Textual Criticism, such as those regarding author and authorship, also proposing a theoretical discussion about the conditions of knowledge in the fields of literary studies and the humanities.

The last contribution to this volume, was written by César Nardelli Cambraia, who works as Full Professor at the Federal University of Minas Gerais (UFMG) and is the author of *Introdução à Crítica Textual*, published by Martins Fontes, in 2005. Together with the organizer of this volume of the *Gragoatá* journal, Cambraia is one of the founders of the Textual Criticism Working Group of the National Association of Postgraduate Studies in Literature and Linguistics (ANPOLL). In his article, Cambraia discusses, from the perspective of Textual Criticism, the sources of the abbreviated version of the Spanish translation of the work of Isaac of Nineveh, a theologian from the 6<sup>th</sup> century, in addition to its transmission and reception, analyzing testimonies in Greek, Latin, Italian, Spanish, Catalan and Portuguese. Cambraia’s essay follows a trend that works

with a dialogue between Textual Criticism and Historical Linguistics and with Cultural Studies. Furthermore, it also brings back names such as that of Isaac of Nineveh, who died in what is now Iraq, leading us to think of the importance of south-south dialogue, as the recently deceased philosopher and theologian Enrique Dussel had suggested.<sup>4</sup>

Therefore, dear readers, with this volume of *Gragoatá*, you will have access to several doors that can take you to the intriguing and interdisciplinary universe of Textual Criticism. You just have to open them with generosity, and you will certainly be welcomed and received with hospitality<sup>5</sup>.

## References

BENJAMIN, Walter. *Magia e técnica, arte e política*. Obras escolhidas, vol. 1. Trad. Sérgio Paulo Rouanet. 8. ed. São Paulo: Brasiliense, 2012.

CHARTIER, Roger. *A mão do autor e a mente do editor*. Trad. George Schlesinger. São Paulo: Ed. UNESP, 2004.

DUSSEL, Enrique. *1492 - O encobrimento do outro: a origem do mito da modernidade*. Trad. Jaime A. Clasen. Petrópolis: Vozes, 1993.

SAID, Edward W. *Orientalismo: o Oriente como invenção do Ocidente*. Trad. Rosaura Eichenberg. São Paulo: Cia das Letras, 2007.

VICHINSKY, Flávio Garcia. *Os Lusíadas para os 'lusitos': o destino do épico camoniano no liceu português e a interferência do Estado Novo*. 2015. Tese (Doutorado) - Universidade de São Paulo, São Paulo, 2015. Disponível em: <http://www.teses.usp.br/teses/disponiveis/8/8150/tde-09032016-161458/>. Acesso em: 16 fev. 2024.

<sup>4</sup>See: Dussel, 1993.

<sup>5</sup>“Generosity” and “hospitality” are terms used by Edward Said in *Orientalism* (1979) to refer to two of the characteristics of Philology/Textual Criticism.